

Narrative and Cinematic Aspects in Commercial and Art Films as Directors' Artistic Treatments: a Comparative Study

Lucia Ratnaningdyah Setyowati, GR Lono Lastoro Simatupang, and Budi Irawanto

Program Studi Pengkajian Seni Pertunjukan dan Seni Rupa,
Sekolah Pascasarjana Universitas Gadjah Mada Yogyakarta.

Jl. Teknik Utara, Pogung, Sleman, Yogyakarta 55281

Email: lono_simatupang@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

Data shows that award-winning films are not always the best-selling films and vice versa. Therefore, it is interesting to investigate whether the director employs different art techniques for commercial and art films. This qualitative textual study examines the artistic treatments of both films and compares the narrative aspects of the story and the cinematic elements related to the film presentation techniques. The narrative aspects include (a) plot, (b) premise, (c) characters, and (d) conflict. The cinematic elements include (a) cinematography, (b) editing, (c) sound, and (d) setting. The results show that the director applies different art techniques for different films. For films orientated to commercial movie theaters, the narrative is more complex but presented in a cinematic that is easier for the audience to understand. For films in festivals, the narrative is more simple, but the cinematic aspect are more complex. These findings support the results of the data control, a combination of the best-selling and award-winning films, which shows that the film has a rather complex narrative and visualizations but is relatively easy to understand.

Keywords: narrative aspect; cinematic elements; director's art techniques; art films; commercial films

ABSTRAK

Aspek Naratif dan Sinematik dalam Film Komersial dan Film Seni Sebagai Olah Artistik Sutradara Film. Data menunjukkan bahwa film yang meraih banyak penghargaan di festival bukanlah film yang laris di bioskop serta sebaliknya. Fenomena ini menarik untuk diteliti dengan mengkaji apakah sutradara menerapkan perlakuan artistik yang berbeda antara film yang ditujukan untuk ditayangkan di bioskop dan film yang dikirim ke festival. Penelitian tekstual ini mengkaji pengolahan artistik yang dilihat dari dua aspek yaitu aspek naratif yang berkaitan dengan cerita serta aspek sinematik yang berkaitan dengan teknik penyajian film. Hasil yang didapatkan memperlihatkan bahwa sutradara mengolah artistiknya secara berbeda pada kedua ranah tersebut. Di ranah bioskop naratifnya lebih kompleks namun disajikan dalam sinematik yang lebih mudah dipahami penonton, sementara di ranah festival, naratifnya lebih sederhana tetapi olahan sinematiknya lebih kompleks. Hasil ini dipertegas dengan hasil kontrol data di ranah gabungan yang memberikan naratif yang agak kompleks melalui sajian yang agak kompleks namun juga relatif mudah dipahami.

Kata kunci: aspek naratif film; elemen sinematik; teknik artistik sutradara; film seni; film komersial

Introduction

Indonesian people have gotten more used to watching movies. The data shows that Indonesian movies have more audiences than in previous years. For example, the Indonesian film website notes that *Warkop DKI Reborn: Jangkrik Bos Part 2 (2016)* reached 6,858,616 audiences (www.filmindonesia.or.id). Meanwhile, the most-watched film 30 years ago, *Ari Hanggara (1986)*, only reached 382,708 audiences. Then, 20 years later, *Get Married* was in the first rank with a total of 1,389,454 audiences. It shows the increasing number of audiences for Indonesian films. The number of audiences in Indonesia did not reach 1 million before 1994. Only in 2002, the movie started to reach 1 million audiences. It was achieved through *Ada Apa Dengan Cinta*, which was estimated reached 2,700,000 audiences.

In addition, Indonesian films have received many awards both in national and international festivals. The Indonesian Film Website records that *Bernafas Dalam Lumpur* was awarded the best soundtrack in Asian Film Festival in 1970. Also, at the same festival, *Pengantin Remaja* was awarded for the best film in 1971. Moreover, *Ibunda* received 9 awards in FFI, *Ada Apa dengan Cinta* received 7 awards in Bandung Film Festival 2002, and 4 awards in FFI 2004. In 2016, *Turah* achieved awards in Singapore International Film Festival and JAFF, and in the following year, it received 1 award in Vietnam Film Festival and 3 awards in Tempo Film Festival (www.filmindonesia.or.id, nd).

However, the number of awards does not in line with the number of audiences. *Ari Hanggara*, the most-watched film in 1986, only received 2 awards from FFI, which shows a great gap compared to *Ibunda*, which received many awards in the same year. Likewise, *Get Married*, the most-watched film in 2008, only received 4 awards; 1 from IMA and 3 from FFI. On the other hand, *Nagabonar 2 (2007)* was awarded 9 trophies from IMA, FFI, and JIFFest). Unexpectedly, *Warkop DKI Reborn: Jangkrik Bos Part 2 (2017)*, the most-watched film in the history, did not receive any award.

It shows that the awards won by a film do not significantly influence the Indonesian (Bordwell

& Kristin Thompson, 2008) audiences. Thus, it is interesting to note that the best-selling film is not associated with the award-winning film in the festival, and vice versa.

This research aims to examine whether the director as the filmmaker has made any changes in its art techniques. The term artistic aspect is seen through narrative and cinematic elements proposed by David Bordwell and Kristin Thompson. It later becomes the form of film. It stated by Bordwell & Thompson (2008) and also expressed by Giannetti (1993). Thus, this research applies textual research by analyzing film techniques through qualitative analysis.

It is expected that the research's result will help people to study the type of art technique to the best-selling film and award-winning film. Therefore, the director will gain more information and suits their film to the goal. In addition, they could reach both best-selling and award-winning film. Directors also need to deal with ideas and other elements that support them Santoso (2017).

Methodology

The research applied textual study method and qualitative data analysis. The objects of the research are one best-selling film (at least 2 million audiences), one award-winning film (at least 5 awards, not include the nomination), and one film which gained both best-selling and award-winning film. In addition, those films should be under one director. After researching the list of directors, Riri Riza was chosen as his films suit the research object's criteria.

The data is Riri Riza' film in the last 10 years (2008-2018); *Laskar Pelangi (2008)* for the best-selling film with a total audience of 4,606,785, *Athirah* for winning 7 awards, and the controller is *Ada Apa dengan Cinta 2 (2016)* with a total audience of 3,665,509 and won 5 awards at the festival.

The data then is analyzed through its narrative elements, including a) plot, (b) premise, (c) character, and (d) conflict. Then it is followed by its cinematic elements, including (a) cinematography, (b) editing, (c) sound, and (d) setting. The

cinematic elements are analyzed on how it presents the narrative elements. Bordwell and Thompson stated that cinematic is the film style in presenting its narrative (Bordwell & Thompson, 2008) and Maijar, (2018). After that, the data will be compared and contrasted to analyze its characteristics.

Discussion

The discussion is divided into two parts; narrative elements and cinematic elements. Narrative element in this context is the elements that relate with content of film story. Cinematic element is the elements that support how the story be told in movie screen.

Narrative Elements

The narrative elements consist of Plot, Premise, Character, and Conflict. Plot is how a film tells the story from beginning to end, we call single plot if the plot just goes following one conflict of character, and multi plot if it follows two or more conflicts of characters. There are main plot, and side plot in multi plot. Bordwell defined fabula as a chronological story, and syuzhet as a plot how the story is told. Premise is a thesis or a proposition that stated of the film. Character is a person or other being in narrative, there are protagonist that supported by the premise and antagonist in other side. Conflict is a contradiction or a main problem in a story, a battle of protagonist and antagonist to achieve their goals. Types of conflict are personal conflict, interpersonal conflict, psychological conflict, societal conflict, etc.

Commercial Film

The commercial film refers to the best-selling film in cinema (theatrical release) often called as the hit box office or box office film by Riri Riza is *Laskar Pelangi* (2008). This film tells about a survival of poor school in Gantong vilage, Belitung Island. The film's detail of narrative elements is explained below.

In the plot of this film there are four stories (fabula) that are not shown in the plot (syuzhet). However, the audience could understand them

through the dialogue and grown-up Ikal's narration. One of them is the story about the education authorities does not permit SD Muhammadiyah Gantong (elementary school) to open the school unless they have at least 10 students. Though it is not on the scene, it can be interpreted based on the dialogue of Pak Harfan to the students' parents, Bu Muslimah (the teacher), and Ikal narration when he reminiscences his early year in the school. Applying a pseudo backward plot, the narrative could be well understood by the different characters, especially those who have grown up (Ikal and Lintang). In the end, the plot is moving forward as Ikal visits his hometown and meets Lintang, and they share their stories. It is then continued with Lintang receives a postcard from Ikal, who is in France. The complexity of the plot is manifested in the multiplot; the main plot is around *Laskar Pelangi* group, and the side plot is around Ikal and Lintang.

The premise of this film can be formulated as follows, "The character strength becomes their perseverance to face the life challenges". The resume like this also stated in Rawung (2013). Egri (1960) stated that the premise contains the protagonist element. In this case, the one who has a strong character is *Laskar Pelangi* group as they keep striving no matter how difficult their challenges are. Their strength is reflected in their inability to complain about the lack of educational facilities in the school, such as no calculator to help them count, even in-debt in the shop for chalks. Besides, they also are not facilitated well by the family, such as not having proper shoes and clothes for school. Nevertheless, they are enthusiastically going to school no matter how far the distance and the weather are. Moreover, the crocodiles blocking them do not turn them back. On the contrary, instead of complaining, they support each other; those who are clever will teach their friends also they comfort each other when they are in trouble. In addition to the protagonist, Egri also stated that the premise contains a conflict: what challenges do the characters face? The answer is that the school is almost canceled; not recognized by the community and the education authorities, and not allowed to hold their own exams. Given that, the conflict is about their life, whether they are able to survive or fall drowned

by the conflict. Next, the issue is answered at the ending of the story. Egri also stated that is indicated in the premise. The characters have perseverance which enables them to survive. Slowly but surely, the children and their teachers succeed in achieving their goals, winning the carnival, and finally winning the quiz competition, even defeating the PN Timah Elementary School, which is equipped with luxurious facilities. The story ends happily with Ikal's success in arriving in France following his dream and Lintang's success in educating his daughter to become a smart child at school.

The third element of narrative is Character. As stated in the premise, the protagonist is *Laskar Pelangi* group. They are a group of elementary school children that are consist of ten students with Bu Mus and Pak Harfan, their teacher who strive to maintain the school's existence and students' right to learn. Some of the names of ten students are Ikal (Haekal), Lintang, Mahar and Harun.

At Conflict element, there are data that the main conflict is the life struggle. The protagonists face life challenges, which is called societal conflict. The protagonist must face deep-rooted poverty, pressures on differences in social status, existential crises, and the threat of inaccessibility to education (Seger, 1987). People even think they do not need to go to school because later they will only become labor. There are times the children have to witness how different they are from the SD PN Timah students. Moreover, they have to sit in for exam which brings pressure as they are inferior. The existence crisis had occurred since the beginning when schools were almost abolished and even continues when the judges for the quiz contest doubt Lintang's abilities. However, they are able to solve the conflicts due to their togetherness and their dreams as their character strength.

The paragraph above concludes the narrative elements of the best-selling film. The following sub will discuss the narrative of the award-winning film or art film.

Art Film

It refers to an award-winning film. The data is taken from *Athirah* (2016) by Riri Riza. The narra-

tive elements are elaborated on below. Plot of this film keep 7 stories (fabula) that are not shown in the plot (syuzhet). However, audiences could interpret the stories implicitly through visual elements and clue dialogue or visual logic. For example, that Athirah leaves her children with Puang Aji in Bone when she moves to Makassar is not shown in the scene. Instead, it could be interpreted through her dialogue with Rusdi, the driver. In scene 3, she asked him to pick up her children and cousins at Makassar. Though there is no scene that he does pick up the kids, scene 8 presents three children eating together with Athirah. Given that, audiences understand that Rusdi picks them up even though there is no direct narrative on that. Many stories in the film also follow the same line.

The premise of this film can be formulated as follow, "Letting it be but never giving up. It will turn to be our strength to face the challenge even in the most difficult challenge in marriage". Given that, we could conclude that the protagonist is the one who possesses this trait, Athirah. She eventually let her husband in a polygamous relationship with another woman. However, she did not give up on fate. She cries, mourning her life but only for a moment. She strives to be empowered, especially financially. Inspired and cheered by her mother, she decides to sell sarong. According to Egri, the question to indicate the conflict is what the protagonist has to face. The answer then is her hard life challenge. She has to face the rumor of her husband's polygamous relationship meanwhile; she never expects it as she thought everything was fine. Also, her husband never mentions it. Then, she asks the driver to tell her the truth. Her heart is broken to pieces when she hears the driver, Rusdi, saying that the wedding ceremony is tonight. Her husband never tells this matter. He only mentions that he is going on a business trip. It must be painful for her to hold their children's feelings. Besides, she is pregnant. In addition, the question for ending from the premise is how the protagonist resolution to solve the conflict. Is he lose/weak or win/strong to face the conflict? The premise states about the strength. Therefore, we could say that in the end, she is strong enough to face the challenges. Even though it ends with an open ending, the scene

where Athirah looking silently at the looms and sarongs which were dried indicates that her business is running, and she is able to survive through her crisis and face the future. It is a contemplative open ending.

According to premis statement, clear that the protagonist character is Athirah, a woman, a wife, and a mother who strive to maintain their marriage. She is a strong mother who is able to take care of the family even without her husband's presence (Siautta, 2020). She is a main character that has main conflict in the story and has a resolution to solve the conflict as the ending of this story.

The conflict is the life challenges, especially in marriage. The life married is portrayed through the character of Puang Aji, Athirah husband, so the story leads most of the narrative focuses on Athirah and Puang Aji conflicts, both in visual (or dialogue) and inner conflicts. Hence, it is called *relational conflict* (Seger, 1987).

Commercial Film and Art Film

The data is taken from *Ada Apa Dengan Cinta 2 (2016)*, a best-selling and award-winning film. The narrative element is explained below.

In the film plot, there are 14 stories (fabula) that are not shown in the plot (syuzhet). The audiences could interpret them through dialogue, logic, and its context related to the previous sequel *AADC (2002)*. For example, there is no scene on when on how Alya died. She does not appear in *AADC 2*. However, audiences could interpret it through the scene where Cinta and her friends visited her grave and Cinta's dialogue with Rangga. This film has 2 plot around Cinta and Rangga as main plot and around Rangga's conflict with her mother is second plot. Oktaviani & Nugroho (2016) states that the whole character is the protagonist.

The premise that can be formulated from this film is "Forgiveness and being honest with yourself will help you to see the problem clearly and make the right decision". To accept Rangga, Cinta needs to forgive Rangga, giving him the opportunity to explain. Therefore, Cinta could eventually understand why Rangga broke up with her. In the end, Cinta is able to be honest with herself that she still

loves Rangga and decides to choose him instead of marrying Trian. Cinta forgiving Rangga can be seen from the scene where he finally wills to meet Rangga and accepts his help to find a taxi even though she just slaps Rangga. Besides, it is emphasized through their dialogue when they discuss Rangga's mother. Cinta says if she could forgive Rangga, then he should also be able to forgive his mother. It clearly shows that she has forgiven him. In the previous sequel, Rangga mother left Rangga and his father alone. It cuts off the family relationship. In this sequel, his half-sister expects him to meet his mother as she longs for him. Dealing with forgiveness, Cinta and Rangga are able to tell the stories well, and she could grasp the problem much more clearly even though she is confused due to his engagement with Trian (soon married). The film's climax is when Rangga asks Cinta to reunite with him, but Cinta refuses it. She is not being honest with herself. However, with the help of Trian's assertiveness (asks Cinta to tell the truth), Cinta eventually chooses to reunite with Rangga.

Therefore, it can be concluded that the protagonist is Cinta instead of Rangga. Cinta clearly shows his effort, to be honest with herself and make the right decisions. Rangga's steps are almost similar to Cinta, but Cinta's effort is more highlighted in this film. Besides, it is not Rangga's decision that becomes the turning point of the conflict towards the ending, but Cinta's decision. Her decision also leads to a closed happy ending. It leads to a conclusion that the protagonist is Cinta, a grown-up, independent woman and ready for marriage.

The conflict as the third narrative element of this film is happens between Cinta and Rangga. They wonder if they should be in love or move on. The conflict which is around their romance is classified under relational conflict. It concludes the analysis on its narrative element. The following sub will examine its cinematic elements.

Cinematic Elements

Commercial Film

The cinematic elements of *Laskar Pelangi (2008)* are analyzed through four aspects; cinematography,

editing, sound, and setting. It shows the style or technique in presenting the narrative elements, because the scenes convey the message content (Haryanto, 2011).

Presenting Plot

Not all of stories present in the plot film but the stories/fabula could be interpreted by the four elements: Cinematography, Editing, Sound and Setting.

The cinematography presents scenes that assist the audiences in connecting the visual logic with the help of dialogue. For example, the story of the school receiving an ultimatum letter that requires a minimum of 10 students from the education authorities is indicated by a visual of Pak Harfan holding the folded paper shown to Bu Mus. It is supported with synchronous dialogue telling they cannot ignore the letter. Pak Harfan keeps holding the letter when explaining to parents. Likewise, the story of Ikal arriving in France which is not presented in the plot but can be predicted through a close-up scene of a postcard with a picture of the Eiffel Tower and Paris letter brought by the postman. It is received by Lintang's daughter and handed in to Lintang along supported with his dialogue. It ends with a zoom-in on the postcard tucked above Lintang's award certificate. This scene is supported by the story logic from the previous scene when Ikal tells Lintang that he is going to the Sorbonne, France. It is then connected with a visual close-up of an airplane taking off.

The editing plays a significant part in connecting the image to form the story logic. For example is the story which tells about Ikal who has arrived in France. After he tells Lintang that he is going to France, the scene is followed up with a plane ready to take off. Then it is continued with a postman delivering a postcard. Here, the postcard is zoomed-in showing Eiffel tower picture and Paris letters. The scene never shows Ikal take the plane or any information on the flight to France. However, the images already tell the stories well. In addition, editing also condenses the time. For example, it could rewind the event five years ago. There is a scene showing Harun runs on the grass to the school which makes him a hero as he becomes the

tenth student in the first day of grade 1. Later the scene is followed with Bu Mus showing a wide smile. Then, it is reconnected with the same visual as Harun's feet running on the grass but with his friends, a bigger version of them, and a caption "5 years later". The narrative also validates the story that the school was lasted until five years later when Ikal and his friends are in the fifth grade.

The audio or sound takes a significant role in *Laskar Pelangi* (2008). It presents the stories which are not shown in the plot. Ikal's narration starting at the opening, has explained many stories. Since the start, he has narrated that 10 is a sacred number. It is then supported by an official letter that requires 10 students for the school to officially open. Earlier, there was a voice-over dialogue by Ikal's mother, who hoped there would be 10 students, so her child could attend school. It is then supported by Pak Harfan dialogue with Bu Mus and the students' parent. The voice over narrative by Ikal also plays an important role in explaining and emphasizing touching scenes about Lintang, who could no longer stay in school. It can be seen through the long waiting of Bu Mus and students, the man who delivers the letter, and the letter content, which explain his reason to leave the school. The setting is made clear through caption or subtitles, especially in the beginning of the film. It shows the setting of place and time.

Presenting Premise

The cinematography helps to present the premise by its visual, which is understandable along with its narration. The editing takes part in arranging the scene contrasts. It can be seen from the scene when the students recite *Pancasila*, which contain humanity and justice. The editing shows the contrast through montage shots in the form of visuals showing poverty and injustice.

The sound in the dialogue shows the strength of the characters shaped by the school mission and the norms. The setting shows how persistent the school building is and also the students and teacher. It is portrayed with an almost collapsed building, a leaking roof, and some holes covered with a poster of Rhoma. Setting in the holiday shows how the children are surviving by working instead of playing.

Presenting Character

The cinematography did an excellent job to visualize the protagonist. For example, the camera takes over Bu Mus gaze when Lintang shows up first for school admission. It applies tilt-up movement to show the unclean Lintang but persistent and strong. The tilt-up ends with Lintang face looking at Bu Mus, instead of feeling shy.

The editing plays a role in providing montage to show the protagonist's activities, accompanied by a soundtrack. Besides, the montage shot shows their persistence to win the quiz contest. They strive their best to achieve success as can be seen from pictures with many activities and also voice-over of Bu Mus while she is giving them exercises.

The voice-over sound in the narrative emphasizes the character introduction, as seen in the introduction of Lintang and Harun.

The protagonist is highlighted through the setting of the home. Bu Mus lives with her mother, who works as a tailor. Ikal comes from a labor family, and also Lintang, who lives in an almost-collapsed home near the shore.

Presenting Conflict

The cinematography plays a significant role in supporting the conflict. It can be seen in the scene where Lintang has to fight crocodiles. Besides, there are some visualizations on grief, solitude, and abandonment after Pak Harfan death. It could also be seen in the scene when Lintang father is gone when he sails. It is captured well by showing Lintang face in the mirror piece attached to the wall, right under the award certificate of quiz contest.

The editing plays an important role in visualizing the conflict between Lintang and crocodile through cut-to-cut editing. It shows how the protagonist is annoyed with it. It is visualized using cut to cut editing, showing the crocodile, the different positions of Lintang, his friends' expression, and the teachers' movement at school.

The sound dominates the conflict through dialogue and narration. The back song also provides information through "*janganlah berhenti*" lyric at the end of "*Hujan*". It shows the children joy no matter how hard they should strive during the holiday.

The setting supports visualizing the contrast in conflict. It can be seen from the warning sign in the cluster area of "*Timah (tin)*" that shows social strata rigidity. It is also visualized with barbed wire in the field, which separates Flo, PN Timah children and Mahar. It is where the children talk with Mahar and friends before the security guard chases them away.

Art Film

Presenting Plot

The Cinematography play a role when Athirah husband comes home late is not visualized through a scene with denotative audio, instead, it is visualized without any dialogue. The shot focuses on the mug and flipped plate, then panning to medium shot on Athirah, who gazes at the mug and the plate. It is then continued with Ucu looking toward the door, expecting someone. Everyone looks tensed. Then, close up shot on the mug and flipped plate. It shows that the father does not have dinner with them.

The editing plays a significant role in Athirah spell-casting. The scene does not show any audio, but it clearly shows how Athirah tries to cast a spell on her husband's drink. Athirah is sitting in line in the room where the offerings are. Upon returning, she is busy preparing things though Ucu gazes at her with a suspicious look. Then, during the dinner, she tells Aisyah to rest so that she could put the small bundle (incantations) in her husband's drink. However, Ira startled her, and the bundle falls. It is then continued with the scene in the dining room, Puang Aji is about to drink his tea. Athirah's gaze watching him is a little restless. The scene ends with a close-up of the bundle that is still lying on the kitchen floor. The audience could interpret that the spell fails since the bundle is not inside the drink.

The sound or the audio does not directly provide information, instead, it uses dialogue clues and visual logic to interpret the plot. As in the story of Puang Aji's second marriage, there is no plot directly shows it. However, it uses indirect dialogue only between Athirah and Rusdi. She asks about the time for the "party"; wedding ceremony and Rusdi answers it will be tonight. Then Athirah looks shocked and is about to cry. There is no clear

explanation of the subject they talk nor the part. However, visual logic helps audiences to understand the story of Puang Aji's second marriage. The dialogue between Athirah and Rusdi helps to link the visual sequences and the story of the second marriage of Puang Aji.

The caption/subtitle assists a lot in visualizing the setting. Besides, it also supported establishing shot to introduce the location. For example, Athirah house in Makasar and Bone are mostly presented with rice fields.

Presenting Premise

The Cinematography depicts Athirah's trait of letting it be in her sighs whenever she faces challenges. It can be seen when she starts suspecting her husband to hearing the news of his marriage. She only sighs without raging her disappointment and anger. She almost sobs, but she sighs and puts a straight face when she notices Ucu is watching her. Nevertheless, she tries to keep strong and answer her children nicely though she expelled her husband at night. She remains calm serving her husband. However, the children are looking at each other. Her tenacity is depicted through her persistence in selling sarong and the more jewelry insides the jewelry box.

Combined with the cinematography, the editing manages the premise; Athirah persistence facing the challenge, through a montage shot. It starts with selling sarong, then fails in putting incantations. She then works harder after knowing her husband prefers to attend a wedding with his new wife. The montage shots alternated between Athirah ordering a sarong to a craftsman, busy selling to customers, and adding more jewelry into its box. There was no significant dialogue in the scene.

Though only a little, the sound also contributes to the premise, as seen in the scene after Athirah mother hands in her jewelry to Athirah. It can be heard a low voice-over saying "I want to sell sarongs, Mak (Mom)" then accompanied with the dissolve to shot of the sarongs being dried in the sun and Athirah's face appeared between the sarongs. It visualizes her intention to be empowered. Premise about Athirah never give up is depicted in

the changing setting between Bone-Makasar that showing Athirah's persistence in selling her sarongs.

Presenting Character

Cinematography has a technique to depict the protagonist. Athirah, appears most often in the shot and often gets close-up and medium shots. Some scenes contain only Athirah. Moreover, her face also appears in the very first and last scene.

Editing provides clues for a significant object in one frame with Athirah's face or by bringing it closer to Athirah's gaze. Thus, it assists in portraying the protagonist well. For example, a scene when a woman is getting out of a car in front of Puang Aji office, is followed by a shot of Athirah watching her from her pedicab. A shot of Athirah's slightly shocked face was followed by a shot of Athirah touching an open package of 2 cans of hair oil on Puang Aji's office desk. Then it moves to Puang Aji's indifferent expression and returns to a close-up shot of Athirah showing an expression full of questions, without any dialogue.

Sound supports the character of protagonist in different treatment. Various Athirah's expression is mostly visualized without dialogue, sometimes with only a sigh, two times holding her tears, and one anger without raging dialogue. Likewise, she also drives Puang Aji away at night without a word. Silence is the foundation of the protagonist's strength.

The setting does not support the character much. The setting is visualized through the caption of city name and years. The setting portrays the story that polygamy is widely accepted in Bone at that time.

Presenting Conflict

Cinematography portrays the conflict using sarong as a symbol. Several times the cinematography visualizes the sarong in 1 full-frame to mark the dramatic of the conflict.

The editing also connects the mentioned frame of sarong with other appropriate shots to give emotion/soul to the sarong. The climax is the final image of Athirah and Ucu on a pedicab returning from a wedding ceremony connected with a crumpled sarong on the floor. It is continued

with the image of Athirah sobbing and ends with a fade-out to black.

Sound in this film eliminates the dialogue in climax. Only heard a little of Athirah sobbing when she cries in her room after seeing her husband and his new wife at the wedding ceremony. She throws the sarong to the floor accompanied by music illustration that beats softly, raising the dramatic tension. Athirah does not mention why she is crying, but the audience may understand through the visual sequence.

Setting, especially the properties support to portray the conflict. Not only sarong, but the tableware is also used to enhance the dramatic conflict. Tableware is also be one kind of setting in Adimasara (2020). Whenever Puang Aji comes home late or even does not come home, the plates and mugs are still arranged neatly at the table. It shows his absence. However, it turns out different when Athirah moves on from the betrayal. She is more enthusiastic about selling the sarong. Therefore, the atmosphere at home is much cheerful, and jokes could be heard during dinner time. Puang Aji's tableware could not be seen on the table.

Moreover, his seat is used by Ira, Ucu's sister. Given that, when Puang Aji suddenly comes home due to his problem, Ira hears a whisper from Athirah to move. Then Athirah prepares his mug and plates, which are placed on the cupboard. It shows that lately, Puang Aji did not have dinner with them, and they no longer expect him. Athirah has fully empowered.

Commercial Film and Art Film

Below is the explanation of how the cinematic element presents the narrative of *Ada Apa dengan Cinta 2*.

Presenting Plot

Cinematography presenting the story in the plot is mainly with dialogue or a hint of the character's treatment/action towards objects. For example, the incident of Rangga breaking his love for Cinta is presented through Cinta's action. She reopens the memory box containing old memories.

Then the camera shots over-shoulder when Cinta opens a letter. Next is a close-up of Cinta's expression taking a deep breath and then a close-up of the contents of the letter and her hand squeezing the letter. The audience is expected to understand that it is Rangga's letter considering the previous sequel. The letter is in the same box with all the gifts from Rangga, such poetry anthology of "Aku" and Rangga's diary. Later this scene is supported with a scene where Cinta tells Rangga what happened to her when Rangga broke up with her.

The editing connects the images of Rangga looking around at the exhibition, followed by an image of Karmen moving his head, pointing in a particular direction. It means that both of them have agreed that Rangga will meet Cinta there. On top of that, when Rangga appears, Milly and Maura are surprised and say: "are you serious?". It indicates that they are sure if it Karmen's plan. Thus, the editing shows that there is a story that Rangga and Karmen had met to plan for this meeting.

The Sound manages plot in the ways below. Most of the stories which are not presented in the plot are visualized through dialogue information. However, the story of Rangga breaks Cinta heart is visualized through Cinta reads the letter accompanied with music illustration, adapted from the previous sequel. It clues that it comes from the past.

The story of Cinta decides to choose Rangga after Trian asks her to tell honestly in the gallery is actually never presented in the plot. However, the airport setting where Rangga occasionally looks back expecting someone and the scene when Cinta drives her car, clues that they will make up. This setting is similar to the ending scene of the previous sequel. They parted ways but having a happy ending at the airport. Nevertheless, this sequel ends in a pretty different way.

Presenting Premise

Cinematography works with sound to present a premise. Many visualizations of the premise are reinforced by dialogue. For example, the premise of being honest with oneself is not clearly revealed, except for a close-up of Cinta rubbing her lips on the plane. It is against her statement to Rangga at

the gallery telling him that kissing does nothing for her. It shows that her statement is a lie. It is emphasized when she meets Rangga in New York telling him that it is a lie if the kiss does nothing for her.

The editing does not play any significant role in confirming the premise. However, there are a few series of images leading to visual logic. For example, when Cinta is about to honestly tell Trian about her meeting with Rangga, she gets a notification on her phone. Previously, it is shown that Rangga sends a chat message at the hotel. Given that, the audiences might understand that the message is from Rangga. Then, Cinta changes her mind by telling Trian something else.

About the sound, the dialogue and song illustrations visualize the premise well. It is all about forgiveness, honesty, and decision making which are stated well in the dialogue. The setting does not specifically mention the premise.

Presenting Character

The cinematography works well on the song performance at Cinta's gallery. It shows a close-up of Cinta's face holding the falling tears in her eyes and occasionally shots Karmen, who is watching at her. It introduces the protagonist and her conflict. Karmen understands Cinta's past well, and later it sparks conflict between them.

During the voice-over while Rangga is writing the poetry, the editing adds super impose of Cinta character. It clues to whom the poetry is addressed.

The sound has its own mechanism to describe the character. The protagonist's social class be seen through her way of speaking English several times. Besides, the poetry also portrays her character.

Setting in Jogja's iconic places and its surroundings emphasizes that the protagonist is a youth with good taste and vision. She likes coffee shop, Boko temple, arts exhibition and gallery. It matching with its audience, Z generation (Tiaratama & Pamungkas, 2017).

Presenting Conflict

Besides physical conflict between Rangga and Cinta are visualized through dialogue, the cinematography also visualizes the inner conflict

in a single action. For instance, it can be seen from the scene when Cinta unpacking the box of memories and Cinta's confusion when Rangga sends a chat asking to meet again in Jakarta. Cinta looks at the chat several times, being silent, throws her cellphone, sits while shaking her head, and eventually calls her best friend, Karmen.

Editing, in accompany to cinematography, intensifies the conflict by connecting the visuals of Rangga proceeding at the airport with the visuals of Cinta driving a car. This sequel does not end with a happy ending, unlike in the previous sequel where they could meet at the airport. Instead, in this sequel, the scene ends with Cinta almost crashing into an accident and failing to meet Rangga at the airport. About sound, poetry and song take the role to accompany the visuals when there is not any dialogue. It also provides audio information. It visualizes Rangga's grief and disappointment due to his failure. The memorable setting in the previous sequel, the airport, is reused in this sequel to trick the audiences.

Conclusion

To conclude, there are several differences between narrative and cinematic elements in those mentioned films. In the box office film, the narrative is relatively more complex as it applies multi plots. Therefore, it can be said that it is more exciting. However, there is no space left for story interpretation since all stories are visualized in the plot. Therefore, the director uses cinematic, which is easier to understand, informative dialogue in each scene, and a narration that helps audiences understand the stories better. In art film, the narrative is more straightforward and relatively less attractive in the art film due to its single plot. Nevertheless, the director does not reveal all the stories in the plot so that the audiences could guess them. Instead, the director emphasizes visual language so that the cinematic also visualize it in the form of images. Given that, the dialogue does not tell the story explicitly.

In commercial and art film, The director in the best-selling and award-winning film manages more than one plot. Given that, they do not visualize

many stories. This is managed cinematically by providing images along with synchronous dialogue. It is supported with audio information, though not explicitly, to add more artistic touch. Therefore, poetry and songs also tell the story, not only visualizing the atmosphere. To conclude, the director applies different art techniques in commercial and art film. Hence, to reach both areas, the director must work its art techniques to suit both.

Acknowledgement

We would like to thank to ISI Yogyakarta for providing the opportunity and funding for the research. We would also thank the Film and Television Study Program, the Faculty of Recording Media Arts, Indonesia Institute of The Arts, Yogyakarta, and the Study Program of Performing Arts and Visual Arts Studies at the Graduate School of Gadjah Mada University for supporting various administrative facilities needed as well as the opportunity to critique and publish this research.

References

- Adimasara, B. P. (2020). *Setting sebagai Penunjuk Status Sosial dalam Film Athirah*. <http://repository.isi-ska.ac.id/4585/>
- Bordwell, D., & Kristin Thompson. (2008). *Film Art: An Introduction* (8th ed.). US: McGraw-Hill.
- Egri, L. (1960). *The Art of Dramatic Writing*. USA: Touchstone.
- Giannetti, L. (1993). *Understanding Movies* (6th ed.). Singapore: Prentice Hall.
- Haryanto, D. (2011). Semiotika Film Laskar Pelangi. *Dewa Ruci*, 7(1), 161–179. <https://doi.org/10.331.53/dewaruci.v7i1.985>
- Maijar, A. (2018). Film “Tropy Buffalo” Sebagai Sebuah Parodi Kebudayaan Minangkabau Dalam Estetika Posmodern. *Journal of Urban Society's Arts*, 5(1), 29–36. <https://doi.org/10.24821/jousa.v5i1.2199>
- Oktaviani, D. D., & Nugroho, S. (2016). Pola Karya Konvensi pada Film Sekuel Studi Kasus Film Ada Apa Dengan Cinta? 2. *Jurnal Kajian Seni*, 3(1), 81–94. <https://jurnal.ugm.ac.id/jks/issue/view/3107>
- Rawung, L. I. (2013). Analisis Semiotika pada Film Laskar Pelangi. *Jurnal Acta Diurna Komunikasi*, 2(1). <https://ejournal.unsrat.ac.id/index.php/actadiurnakomunikasi/article/view/976/791>
- Santoso, V. (2017). Kapital dan Strategi Garin Nugroho dalam Proses Produksi Film. *Journal of Urban Society's Arts*, 4(1), 11–18. <https://doi.org/10.24821/jousa.v4i1.1492>
- Seger, Linda. (1987). *Making A Good Script Great*. Samuel French.
- Siautta, S. Y. et al. (2020). Selubung Ketidakadilan Peran Gender dalam Motherhood pada Film Athirah. *Jurnal Tuturlogi*, 1(3), 165–183. <https://tuturlogi.ub.ac.id/index.php/tuturlogi/article/view/66>
- Tiaratama, E., & Pamungkas, I. N. A. (2017). Peran Generasi Y sebagai Talkers pada Generasi Z. *Menciptakan Word of Mouth (WOM) Film Ada Apa Dengan Cinta 2 (AADC 2)*. www.filmindonesia.or.id. (n.d.).