

Jaap Kunst Legacy: A Site of Forgetting, Remembering and History-Making

Citra Aryandari¹

Jurusan Etnomusikologi, Fakultas Seni Pertunjukan, Institut Seni Indonesia Yogyakarta

ABSTRAK

Warisan Jaap Kunst: Situs Melupakan, Mengingat, dan Membuat Sejarah. Tulisan ini menginterogasi dan mengonfigurasi ulang proyek pembukaan warisan etnomusikolog yang bernama Jaap Kunst. Jaap Kunst merekam banyak musik Indonesia selama tinggal di Indonesia dari tahun 1919-1934 dan menjadikan sebagai bahan ajar serta pengembangan konsep etnomusikologi sebagai ilmu pengetahuan berdasar rekaman suara dan pengalaman penelitiannya. Kini, setelah hampir 100 tahun, Departemen Musikologi Universitas Amsterdam memprakarsai pembukaan warisan Jaap Kunst yang belum sempat dipublikasikan. Warisan ini terkait dengan sejarah dan ingatan budaya Indonesia, Universitas Van Amsterdam bekerja sama dengan akademisi dari Indonesia dan berusaha mencari dukungan dari pemerintah Indonesia. Tulisan ini memperkenalkan pendekatan filosofis untuk refleksi: kritis, hermeneutik, serta fenomenologis. Mengungkapkan hubungan dinamis antara warisan Jaap Kunst sebagai artefak sejarah dan situs melupakan, mengingat, dan membuat sejarah. Bagaimana ingatan dan identitas yang tersimpan dalam materi Jaap Kunst diinterpretasikan ulang di era pascakolonial? Bagaimana etnomusikologi menyikapi hal ini terkait dengan pembentukan pengetahuan kolonial ke dalam berbagai posisi subjek? Pembahasan dalam tulisan ini menggunakan pendekatan retrospektif di mana individu diambil sampelnya dan dikumpulkan informasi tentang masa lalunya. Melalui wawancara beberapa partisipan diminta untuk mengingat kembali peristiwa-peristiwa penting, atau dengan mengidentifikasi data administrasi yang relevan untuk mengisi informasi tentang peristiwa dan keadaan masa lalu. Dengan cara itu dapat diasumsikan menelusuri peninggalan Kunst seperti berlibur ke rumah nenek, membawa kembali semua kenangan tapi tidak harus terkait dengan masa kini.

Kata kunci: Jaap Kunst; warisan; etnomusikologi; kolonial; post-kolonial

ABSTRACT

This study investigates and reconfigures the disclosing project of heritage by an ethnomusicologist, Jaap Kunst. Jaap Kunst recorded a lot of Indonesian music while staying in Indonesia from 1919 to 1934. He enacted the sound recording and his research experience to be the basis of teaching material and the development of ethnomusicology concept as a knowledge. Now, after nearly 100 years, Musicology Department of University of Amsterdam is initiating the opening of Jaap Kunst's legacy that has not yet been published. Since the heritage is closely related to Indonesian cultural history and memory, University of Amsterdam collaborates with academics from Indonesia and undertakes to gain support from Indonesian government. This study introduces philosophical approaches for reflection: critical, hermeneutic, and phenomenological, revealing the dynamic relationship between Jaap Kunst's heritage as a historical artifact and a site of forgetting, remembering, and history-making. This study examines how the memory and identity stored in Jaap Kunst's materials were reinterpreted in the postcolonial era and how ethnomusicology addresses this matter related to shaping the colonial knowledge into the various subject positions. The author implemented retrospective approach in which samples were taken from the individuals and information about their past was collected. Through interviews some participants were asked to recall essential events. Besides, the author identified relevant administrative data to fill in the information gap and circumstances of the past events. By applying the method, tracking down Kunst's heritage is like taking a vacation at grandma's house, bringing back all the memories but not necessarily related to the present.

Keywords: Jaap Kunst; legacy; ethnomusicology; colonial; postcolonial

¹ Alamat korespondensi: Program Studi Etnomusikologi, Fakultas Seni Pertunjukan, Institut Seni Indonesia Yogyakarta, Jalan Parangtritis Km. 6.5 Yogyakarta. *E-mail:* citraaryandari@gmail.com; *HP:* 081804241719.

Introduction

The project of Disclosing Jaap Kunst Legacies was initiated by Universiteit van Amsterdam and funded by European Heritage. Jaap Kunst, a Dutch East-Indie musicologist, recorded music in the archipelago in 1919- 1934. The legacy left behind is very numerous and varied, not only material quantity but the story behind the material. After fifteen years of living in the Dutch East Indies with technology that is still limited, and the records of travel and field research are re-opening, Kunst's legacy is mainly in sound recordings, photos, films, correspondence about music spread across the Indonesian archipelago. There have been talks about Opening Kunst Legacies with the Indonesian government, but there has been no progress on the jointly initiated cooperation. The development of critical discourse constantly has questions of colonial archives. How will this archive be opened? For who? What is the relationship between archives, knowledge, and colonial power?

About 100 years ago, Kunst decided to leave his job as a legal expert at a bank in the Netherlands. He tried his new luck as a musician by traveling with his two friends to the Dutch East Indies or now known as Indonesia. Performing from stage to stage as many as 95 concerts in eight months at several clubs in Java, Sumatra, Sulawesi, and Kalimantan became a new activity that ultimately changed Kunst's life. While in Yogyakarta, Kunst saw gamelan performances at the Pakualaman Palace for the first time, and he was fascinated by the harmonization of gamelan sounds (van Zanten, 1993). According to him, the sound is gorgeous and has its complexity. Because of his interest, Kunst started recording gamelan performances using the recording technology that was becoming a trend. Wax cylinder, an incredible invention from Thomas Alfa Edison at the end of 1908 (Pelikan, 2013), became the only way to record and immortalize the sound of gamelan even though it only lasted 2-4 minutes (Poole, 2015). Kunst saw and heard that gamelan had a different form and musical structure from his familiar music. With a pitch that is also different from the violin he usually plays. Because of the differences and his curiosity about the new

types of music he knew and heard, he sent the recording from the wax cylinder to Hornbostel, a German musicologist who worked at the Berlin Phonogram Archive. Berlin Phonogram Archive already had the technology to transfer sound from the wax cylinder to a more stable plate. Through correspondence, Kunst began to discuss the sound of gamelan with Hornbostel actively. However, not a musicologist but a legal expert Kunst grew up in a musical environment because his parents were musicians. With Hornbostel, Kunst also had intense discussions with an artist and architect from Yogyakarta named KRT Joyodipuro. Even Kunst stayed at KRT Joyodipuro's house to enjoy gamelan performances. Kunst also often asked KRT Joyodipuro for special arrangements by paying a sum of money. Besides KRT Joyodipuro, Kunst also made musical friendships with Mangkunegoro VII. This story is known from the correspondence archives, which are still stored in the University van Amsterdam library (Barendregt & Bogaerts, 2014).

Kunst's interest in gamelan finally made him choose to stay in the Dutch East Indies and separate from his two colleagues. Kunst began to spend a lot of time studying music in the archipelago and not just gamelan. To make ends meet, Kunst looks for a new job. In 1920 Kunst was accepted as a senior team member of the Ministry of Social Affairs in Batavia and then moved to Bandung. As a team member, Kunst no longer has much free time to do field research, however, in one year, he gets 14 days off, and he uses that holiday to do field research in Bali while on his honeymoon. In addition, the time after the office is also well used to conduct field research around Jakarta and Bandung. Kunst is also very active in correspondence with Hornbostel and several of his musical friends, such as Mangkunegoro VII and KRT Joyodipuro. Kunst also published his research, such as *De toon kunst van Bali* (The Music of Bali, 1925) and also *Hindoe-Javaansche muziekinstrumenten* (Hindu Javanese musical instruments, 1927) (McLeod, 1970). Kunst's writings received positive responses from several European institutions, such as the Koninklijke Academie van Wetenschappen (Royal Academy of Sciences) and the French Legion d'Honneur.

In 1927 Kunst returned to the Netherlands for the first time and was invited to give lectures in the Netherlands and its surroundings to meet the distance teacher, Hornbostel, for the first time. Kunst became known as a music researcher and received many grants from the Dutch East Indian Government. Finally, in 1930 Kunst was appointed as a music researcher at the Ministry of Education and returned to the Dutch East Indies. With his new position, Kunst began to travel extensively for field research. With his wife Kathy van Wely, Kunst founded Archive Musicology which collects photographs, sound recordings, silent films, and instruments. Unfortunately, in 1932 the government cut the budget to abolish the position as a music researcher. And Kunst took over as secretary of the director who was in charge of visiting remote places in the Dutch East Indies. A condition that is difficult to describe in words between losing the official profession as a music researcher but getting the opportunity to visit remote areas that are very rare. Kunst visited many small islands around Sumatra, Sulawesi, Flores, Timor, Maluku, New Guinea. He encountered very diverse music and was constantly recording. Kunst approaches the community to be able to record music in various ways. As a colonial, Kunst started his introduction to the people he visited by playing his violin and then asked the people to play the music, this method is known as the Jaap Kunst method. To record the music, which is not an easy task, recording large enough equipment is a new and scary item for remote communities, so to record, Kunst often has to pay personal money (H. & Kunst, 1956). In 1934 Kunst returned to the Netherlands and published the essay *De Toonkunst van Java*, widely known as Music in Java. In the Netherlands, Kunst began lecturing on music ranging from his research in Terschelling to New Guinea. In 1936 Kunst was appointed curator of the Department of Anthropology of the former Colonial Institute in Amsterdam (Royal Tropical Institute).

With his knowledge as a music researcher in the Dutch East Indies, Kunst became affiliated with the University of Amsterdam in 1942, which meant he taught as a visiting lecturer. After giving a

lecture entitled "*De waardering de exotische muziek* (The appreciation of exotic music)," he taught comparative musicology (Kunst, 1949). Kunst began to position himself as a music scientist and dared to fight latent Eurocentrism (Rouget & Kunst, 1960). The second world war broke out with Germany occupying the Netherlands, giving Kunst free time to work with materials and travel notes while in the Dutch East Indies. His work in the form of books, articles, and brochures became widely known. In 1950 he was elected honorary president of the International Folk Music Council and the Society for Ethnomusicology and had the opportunity to study comparatively in America year.

After returning from his trip to America, Kunst was appointed as a lecturer at the University van Amsterdam (UvA) in 1953. With his first speech entitled *Sociologische bindingen in de muziek* (Sociological relationships in music), Kunst explained the relationship of music that cannot be separated from a broad social context (Blacking, 1955). And not only discussing Indonesia but the whole world. Between 1940-1954 Kunst had many assistants who studied under his supervision, one of which was Mantle Hood, who wrote about the Javanese Tonal System. Hood then brought what he learned from Kunst regarding scientific traditions and taught at UCLA in America. Kunst had not returned to Indonesia since 1934, died in 1958 of throat cancer, and became a member of the Royal Dutch Academy of Sciences.

What Kunst taught his students is now widely known as a discipline called ethnomusicology. The recorded materials are stored in several places, including the Bijzondere Collection UvA, Berlin Phonogram Archive, the National Museum of Indonesia in a condition that is not well organized, after being approximately 100 years old. In 2017 the UvA Department of Musicology initiated a project to open the legacy of Kunst under Curator Barbara Titus. A musicologist who teaches at the UvA, besides having spent his childhood living in Indonesia.

In 2020, along with the pandemic, Barbara Titus conveyed the good news about a new program that she initiated called Decolonizing of South East

Asia Sound Archive, where one of her project pilots opened the legacy of Kunst. By collaborating with many parties from Europe and SEA, DeCoSEAS is funded by the Joint Programming Initiative (JPI) on Cultural Heritage and Global Change supported by the European Union's Horizon 2020 Research and Innovation Program. DeCoSEAS wants to liberate the archives of South East Asia to be accessed by the public and open a dialogue about the archives. An exciting activity, but one needs to rethink how postcolonial society views archives? Is it urgent to remember, forget, or make new history?

Research Method

The Retrospective approach is a method to inspect and adapt to the idea of building incremental progress toward a big goal. This method has an opportunity to get a real-time snapshot of how things are today. Decolonizing sound archives needs to be addressed positively to achieve equality of scientific discourse. The long-stored sound archive contains many entangled issues. Experiences and journeys are the basis for imagining and developing how far this legacy will go.

Result and Discussion

When I was in college, I got to know Kunst through his work entitled *Music in Java*, although I had not finished reading the book. Subjectively I find this book difficult to understand and understand, maybe because, at first glance, each page contains symbols and numbers that look complicated and logical.

I grew up in Yogyakarta, where gamelan is considered a representation of Javanese cultural identity; I only had the opportunity to learn gamelan when studying at the Department of Ethnomusicology. For five semesters, I studied gamelan, but still far from the word 'expert.' Although familiar, the pattern of learning gamelan with number transcription and western music logic is quite confusing and depends on the given sheet music.

In 2014, I was invited to see gamelan learning at the Amsterdam Conservatory by Elsje Plantema

and Michiel Niemantsverdriet; I was amazed because the students in the class were very good at playing the gamelan, and they didn't seem to be reading the partiture. They invited me to play together, and of course, I was very embarrassed because I was not as good as them and depended on the music sheet. I asked Plantema how they could become so proficient and not rely on a music sheet. Plantema briefly replied that playing gamelan, of course, with *rasa*.

In a small research, I tried to record the process of learning gamelan for children in Yogyakarta. I found that almost all gamelan communities use music sheets as a learning method, not with *rasa*. In the book *Music in Java*, Kunst briefly discusses the Sariswara learning method, prioritizing *rasa* (feelings) initiated by Ki Hadjar Dewantara, the founder of the Taman Siswa school and known as the Father of Indonesian Education. But why do gamelan learning methods now rely on numerical notation transcripts? The gamelan notation system with numbers is assumed to have been widely published and adopted because of the book *Music in Java*.

In 2014 I had the opportunity to become a guest lecturer at the Department of Music UvA to teach several Indonesian culture courses with Barbara Titus. On that occasion, Barbara Titus gave me a lot of reading material for lectures on cultural musicology (ethnomusicology), which differed from Kunst's book. These readings opened my narrow mind about ethnomusicology, which was not just discussed music form, function, meaning, organology, and notation. Ethnomusicology, as a scientific discipline developed by Kunst, has grown so widely. However, in Indonesia, the material object of science appears still at the level of cultural preservation efforts and does not follow global discourse.

When at UvA B. Titus shared her rooms with me, she told me that the room once belonged to Ernst Heinz, one of Kunst's students. Not only that, but she also showed Kunst's legacy that was stored in the room. Titus shows a list of Kunst's relics that have been successfully inventoried with an incredible number and variety. And at that moment, I felt like I had just met Kunst. I

saw several collections of wax cylinders, archived correspondence, photos, films, various sound recordings and read a compilation of fascinating writings by Kunst and his students. In the book, I learned that one of the reasons Kunst did field research by recording in exotic areas was the motivation of conservation efforts before all was lost (Kunst, 1949). Kunst feels that the presence of the Missionaries will make the music and performance culture in the archipelago slowly disappear.

In 2017, Barbara Titus said she was chosen as curator to open the Kunst legacy by UvA; she invited me to participate. We organize Kunst heritage instruments, audio, photos, and videos. After obtaining preliminary data regarding Kunst's legacy, we filed a hearing with several relevant parties to seek support. A great start, we were able to meet directly with Mr. Hilmar Farid, who serves as the Director-General of Culture at the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia. We presented Kunst's journey in recording music in the archipelago and playing some of Kunst's recordings. As the authorized official, the Director-General greatly appreciates the project to open the legacy of Kunst and asks his staff to follow up and support the activities we carry out.

In 2018 this support emerged with a focus group discussion activity discussing the work steps of this project at BPNB (Cultural Value Preservation Center) Yogyakarta, which happened to be the house of KRT Joyodipuro, where Kunst once lived in that place. Barbara Titus conveys the distribution and condition of the heritage that needs urgent conservation. Seeing the fantastic amount of the legacies, everyone present was enthusiastic about taking part. One of the attendees from the province of Bali said that Bali had carried out a similar project, namely the repatriation of the Bali documentation of 1928. Edward Herbs initiated this activity from UCLA in collaboration with an academician from Bali I Made Bandem. The 1928 repatriation project digitized the scattered recordings of Balinese art produced by the German company Odeon Beka, and some have been returned to the cultural owner's community. The

people who own the culture are surprised because some people still remember the recording process. The process is exciting because the archive is present as a medium to recall a past event with a different narrative. And a little history was formed (Wolford, 2007).

Hearing what Edward Herbs et al. did in the Bali Repatriation project in 1928, the picture of the urgency of opening up Kunst's legacy becomes more evident and more apparent. Apart from discussing, we also played several pieces of silent film recorded by Kunst. Through this film, the audience witnessed a striking visual change, especially in several parts of Indonesia. Indonesia is anxious about the wave of Islamic radicalism originating from the expansion of Middle Eastern culture as if it gets a breath of fresh air when watching videos of people's lives a hundred years ago. In the Aceh region, which currently applies Islamic law, it turns out that, visually, none of the women were wearing the hijab at that time. The present Director-General implied that if the project opened the Kunst heritage, there might be a significant change in representing cultural identity. And finally, we will continue the planned opening of the Kunst legacy with the Kick-Off program the following year.

In 2019, the Kunst heritage opening program began to be echoed in several European regions. We started to conduct many discussions and workshops with related parties such as Beeld en Geluid in Hilversum, which stores Dutch Audiovisual heritage; Lautarchive at Humboldt University Berlin, which keeps voice archives of various languages and dialects of prisoners of the First World War; Berlin Phonogram Archive which holds diverse the world's collection of musical instruments also recorded sound sent by Kunst and the Vienna Phonogram Archive in Austria which is now active in digitizing and organizing sound archives. From that trip, a visit to Lautarchive caught my attention. I like to go to a tomb with thousands of headstones in it. In a reasonably narrow room filled with safes and sound recording plates with detailed catalogues I had the opportunity to choose several plates to play with. One of the played plates was a recording plate of

a prisoner from Johor who spoke in Malay. He sang a song about his longing for his hometown and hoping to be released soon.

The poem sounds very sad and heart-wrenching. The recording was initiated by a German psychologist named Carl Stumpf, a language teacher, to rule the world with sound culture. Prisoners of World War I who came from colonial countries are a large sample to start research. During the recording process, prisoners were asked questions about their origins and their ability to play music, and after that, they recorded their voices. Some only counted numbers in their language until some sang meaningfully, hoping to be released soon. This condition, at first glance, reminds me of the silent film recorded by Kunst that I have watched to the end. In the video compilation from various archipelago regions, all recorded performances have the meaning of war. In some of his notes, Kunst does not highlight this; he only records and transcribes music from the region, also tells how he persuaded the public to be recorded, which often cost him a lot (Rouget & Kunst, 1960). Based on these records, I assume that people chose war performances to represent resistance to colonialism to be recorded by a colonial. The question then is, can archives track subaltern voices?

At the end of 2019, the Kick-off program was held at the National Museum of Indonesia, and I was not involved. Without much publication, the event showcased Kunst's legacy in the form of an Indonesian musical instrument left at the Museum of the Batavia Royal Society, which is now the National Museum of Indonesia. It is said that the legacy of musical instruments stored is more than 500, and some are still in good condition. After this activity, we no longer heard from the government of the Republic of Indonesia about the continuation of this project.

In 2022, I visited Hans Romp's office at UvA. He's a sound digitizing technician at UvA, he showed off his new and spacious room, which was very different from before. In his new space, Hans displayed several LPs he was and would be digitized on the table. While chatting, he played a record that played jazz music in the early 1900s. The disc is in

excellent condition with all the song narration on it printed on the cover, much like a magazine. The information on the outside is complete, discussing the creation of popular music in America written by Carl H. Scheele, followed by the story of each song on the track.

With the soothing and fun jazz rhythm, we spent the afternoon with a lot of chatter. Hans said he liked to digitize these plates because all the information was clear. Then he compared it to showing some Jaap Kunst record plates, which he found very confusing because there was only one clue in the plate cover, which I knew was referring to the region. Without years and descriptions plus very dense noise, as a digitization technician, Hans transfers to a renewable medium with no more understanding of the sound he is transmitting than a clue to the region where the sound is recorded.

The conversation seemed simple but made me think further. I imagined a time about 100 years ago when jazz music was recorded with complete lingual markings, and sound recordings from my country only had regional indications. In several separate notes from the plates stored in the study room, Jaap Kunst did write down how he recorded the voices and what kind of procedures he had to go through; then, to describe the recorded voices, Jaap Kunst wrote in his way what he did. But rarely narrate the sound in what context. It caught my attention, imagining the different sound archives collected from the same period but in other spaces.

Critics of Archival Relations, Knowledge and Colonial Power

The idea of opening the legacy of Kunst, which is around 100 years old, has not been entirely smooth sailing. The Indonesian government's support as a state directly related to the archives stored until now has not been seen clearly. Kick-off activities regarding Kunst's legacy are more like an exhibition of Indonesian musical instruments, not revealing colonial history. Many factors cannot be related to these archives, which is expected as a form of remembering-forgetting. At the same time, many experts state that, unlike national archives, colonial history is rarely recognized as an

archive for a postcolonial state (Thrush, 2018). This statement is interesting, considering how Soekarno, as the first president of Indonesia, constructed the nation's identity by taking BERDIKARI (Stand on one's own feet) or the contemporary language, "Do It Ourselves" as a movement to reject neocolonialism (Nartey & Ernanda, 2020). This indirectly affects how the Indonesian people view colonial archives.

Kunst's work while in Indonesia (1919-1934) produced a rich archive. The archives highlight many issues, such as how Kunst compiles his material in 'collaboration' with musicians from Indonesia can provide valuable insights into the formation of colonial knowledge. The various modes of understanding culture and expression, problematizing the differences between original and imported musical styles, or written and embodied archives, are closely related to ethnomusicology (Feld & Nettl, 1986).

Meanwhile, in trying to answer the question about looking at the sound files in Hans' room, I remembered an article I had read some time ago. In a dissertation entitled *Community that embodies dance traditions and their changes in Java*, Felicia Hughes-Freeland. The title of this article is very interesting because it counters the phenomenal writings of Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities*. In this paper, She tells about the power of dance as a political representation that has socio-cultural values not as a rule but as being turned on by the Community (Picard, 2010).

In this paper, She shared about how dance in Java exists as a system of representation as well as a form of action. She says her interest in dance is how it helps us understand how people construct their worlds in everyday life and stage performances. In a long research process, armed with scientific mastery of dance notation systems such as Benesh, Laban, or Eshkol Wachman that she obtained at SOAS did not answer his anxiety in contextualizing dance movements with the community. Finally, participating in dance practice and memorizing dance moves and choreography inevitably became the main way to answer her research questions. Friendship with the teacher, physical experience of learning dance, conversations during practice,

and watching dance performances are very helpful in completing the dissertation. From deep observations, she stated that the performances held in Asia had long been part of the secular and religious expressions of the community. Ceremonial dance and dance-drama have also long been associated with centers of power and political rituals. Javanese court dances have long been part of a community that is both realized and imagined. It provides evidence of how dance practices and traditions become involved in social interaction and fosters a sense of identity in local face-to-face communities that are also part of the national state. Kraton dance has undergone a process of debate, positioning, and revival in national cultural politics. Stuck in the state rhetoric of proclaiming the unity of Indonesia, this has long been used to create a semblance of a glorious past for an area dependent on colonial borders. Indeed, scientists often write about the Kraton dance as an Indonesian culture by emphasizing its Hindu-Javanese predecessors (400-1300 AD). Still, this approach is also found in Dutch research on dance and theater in the late colonial period. Some examples include Groneman, documenting the dance of the Yogya Palace (1888-1899) Also, photos of Grebeg by Cephas in 1895, as well as numerous papers published linking Javanese culture with Hinduism and Lelyveld's writings (1931) for colonial exhibitions which treat Javanese court dance as a modern version of a Sanskrit performance. She argues that Javanese court dances are not a 'natural' continuation of an earlier tradition. So far, they have been constructed in a 'modern' way that is self-conscious and must be understood as a series of embodied practices that continue to be carried out and have been worked on by interests determined by the ideas of the political community.

Javanese tradition emerges from a process of political possibility and is strategically constructed by showing that tradition is a process, not an object. In this way, the Kraton tradition demands many associations that predate its chronological origins. Besides, so far, the culture of the palace continues dynamically. By being continued through a '*mutrani*' process, each work is considered a 'child' of the previous work, similar but not the same. The

replication of this tradition is evident in the further branching of the palaces in Java.

The activities that were once elite from the colonial era palace became part of an identity-building plan to create a new independent Indonesian nation through various forms of education, and dance became the foundation of local culture in the newly formed republic. After independence, court dances gradually spread from the king's palace and princely residences to educational institutions, heritage homes, hotels, and, finally, theaters. A contrast distinguishes its aesthetic identity between the inside and outside of the Kraton, and this contrast is ideological. As a newly emerging category, Kraton dance maintains its distinctiveness from other types of performances classified as 'folk' and 'pop' arts.

From the description, I tried to understand why the sound recorded by Kunst lacked lingual signs and mostly only referred to the region. The process of inheritance of traditions that occur in the Javanese palace can at least be used as a reference for how art is developed. The '*mutrani*' process makes work no longer personal but communal. Also, the dynamic inheritance system makes the created works indirectly make recording efforts to extend the work life, not the process's focus. In the literary tradition in Java, in particular, poets are usually sent by the authorities at that time to rewrite (*anyerat ulang*) the writing of the previous poets with interpretations adapted to the conditions of the times; this is interesting if it is related to the process of cultural production which is always tied to the work of the poet previously. I assume that this kind of cultural inheritance process makes the tradition of storing cultural materials not go well in Indonesia.

At a meeting mid 2022 in the province of East Nusa Tenggara, Titus and I shared Jaap Kunst's archives in the form of photos, sounds and videos recorded a hundred years ago from several areas in NTT. The record only mentions the region's name without any other linguistic markings. Unexpectedly, the audience who came to the meeting knew and knew well what we shared; they were even able to explain in detail what was in the archive. They said that although there may have

been many changes, they still recognized the voices, dances, and performances presented in the archives. This experience more or less answered how cultural reproduction process. Also explains the lack of literacy in this process. I see a clear distinction in Eastern society's view of culture. Orality is the main thing, and cultural inheritance is carried out with spoken language and a sufficient time marker system with morning, noon, night, and the rainy season that appears after the dry season. The achievement of artistic creativity is common, so it does not require signs or notations to be written; the important thing is that the community understands these activities for entertainment or rituals. And one more thing I see is that archives are important. Still, I also can't seem to reject the view that in our country, history is present in the form of oral records; therefore, efforts to return archives to the community where the sound was recorded (repatriation) make it possible to present a new historical story.

Conclusion

However, dialogue in ethnomusicology has developed quite dynamically since Kunst started with comparative musicology. About two decades of conferences, classrooms, blogs, and academic literature are uncomfortable with Kunst's ideas that cannot be separated from colonial history (Timothy Rice, 2014). The characteristics of scientific objectivity, cultural evolution, and field research that maintain social distance between researchers and those being studied are considered to have begun to shake their foundations in the context of an increasingly mature scientific landscape ("The Second Wave of Applied Ethnomusicology," 2014). Even some experts say 'Uncertainty' responds to the debate over the division of ethnomusicology and musicology that has existed for generations (Stokes, 2011). Stokes also states that the 'ethno' of musicology may no longer represent the actions of many people or groups because it implies the musicology of others (Stokes, 2018). There are clear boundaries, separating 'us' from 'them.' The insecurity of ethnomusicology as a discipline is not only a space for ongoing discussion about its direction and future,

but new scholarships also offer changing research practices and new alliances (Post, 2017).

Kunst's journey from recording Indonesian music to constructing musical knowledge outside the 'West' is an exciting narrative to discuss. It's like opening a photo album at grandma's house, and there are memories of a time and the vision of whether the future will repeat the same story or be completely different.

References

- Barendregt, B., & Bogaerts, E. (2014). 8. A Musical Friendship: The Correspondence between Mangkunegoro VII and the Ethnomusicologist Jaap Kunst, 1919 to 1940. In *Recollecting Resonances*. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004258594_009
- Blacking, J. (1955). ETHNO-MUSICOLOGY, by Dr. Jaap Kunst. Published by Martinus Nijhoff, The Hague. *African Music: Journal of the African Music Society*, 1(2). <https://doi.org/10.21504/amj.v1i2.259>
- Feld, S., & Nettl, B. (1986). The Study of Ethnomusicology. In *Latin American Music Review/Revista de Música Latinoamericana* (Vol. 7, Issue 2). <https://doi.org/10.2307/780225>
- H., F., & Kunst, J. (1956). Ethno-Musicology. *Journal of the International Folk Music Council*. <https://doi.org/10.2307/834758>
- Kunst, J. (1949). The Cultural Background of Indonesian Music. *Journal of the International Folk Music Council*. <https://doi.org/10.2307/835928>
- McLeod, N. (1970). : Hindu-Javanese Musical Instruments . Jaap Kunst. *American Anthropologist*, 72(1). <https://doi.org/10.1525/aa.1970.72.1.02a00370>
- Nartey, M., & Ernanda. (2020). Formulating emancipatory discourses and reconstructing resistance: a positive discourse analysis of Sukarno's speech at the first Afro-Asian conference. *Critical Discourse Studies*, 17(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/17405904.2019.1617758>
- Pelikan, M. P. (2013). Pelikan's Antidisambiguation: The End of the Wax Cylinder as We Know It. *Against the Grain*, 25(4). <https://doi.org/10.7771/2380-176x.6595>
- Picard, M. (2010). Embodied communities: dance traditions and change in Java - By Felicia Hughes-Freeland. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 16(4). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9655.2010.01661_42.x
- Poole, A. (2015). Determining playback speeds of early ethnographic wax cylinder recordings: Technical and methodological issues. *Ethnomusicology Forum*, 24(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/17411912.2015.1010557>
- Post, J. C. (2017). Introduction: Redesigning and redefining ethnomusicology. In *Ethnomusicology: A Contemporary Reader, Volume II*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315439167>
- Rouget, G., & Kunst, J. (1960). Ethnomusicology, a Study of Its Nature, Its Problems, Methods and Representative Personalities to Which Is Added a Bibliography. *Revue de Musicologie*. <https://doi.org/10.2307/927288>
- Stokes, M. (2011). Afterword: A worldly musicology? In *The Cambridge History of World Music*. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CHO9781139029476.046>
- Stokes, M. (2018). Music and the Global Order. In *Music and Identity Politics*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315090986-18>
- The Second Wave of Applied Ethnomusicology. (2014). *MUSICultures*, 41(2).
- Thrush, C. (2018). Sources and Methods in Histories of Colonialism: Approaching the Imperial Archive. *Australian Historical Studies*, 49(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/1031461x.2018.1454284>
- Timothy Rice. (2014). ETHNOMUSICOLOGY IN TIMES OF TROUBLE. *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, 46. <https://doi.org/10.5921/yeartradmusi.46.2014.0191>
- van Zanten, W. (1993). Jaap Kunst foundation. In *Music and Letters* (Vol. 74, Issue 4). <https://doi.org/10.1093/ml/74.4.656-c>
- Wolford, J. B. (2007). Review of Archive Stories: Facts, Fictions, and the Writing of History. *The Oral History Review*, 34(1). <https://doi.org/10.1525/ohr.2007.34.1.161>